



MICROLINKS

FACILITATING SYSTEMIC CHANGE: INSIGHTS FROM FEED THE FUTURE PROGRAMS IN RWANDA, SENEGAL, GHANA, AND ZAMBIA

WEBINAR CHAT TRANSCRIPT

SEPTEMBER 8, 2016

PRESENTERS

Olaf Kula, ACDI/VOCA

Ben Fowler, MarketShare Associates

Elizabeth Dunn, Impact LLC

Daniel White, ACDI/VOCA

CONTRIBUTORS

Alex Diouf, MarketShare Associates

Charles Ado, MarketShare Associates

MODERATOR

Kristin O'Planick, USAID E3 Office of Trade and Regulatory Reform

Audry Shematsi: hi everyone.

USAID Microlinks: Welcome everyone! Thank you for joining us today. We are getting our presenters set up and will begin the webinar at 9 AM EDT.

USAID Microlinks: Please bear with us for a few minutes while we test our presenters' audio. Thanks for joining early!

Olaf Kula: Hello Audry

USAID Microlinks: Please introduce yourselves to everyone online! Let us know from where you are joining and what organization you are affiliated with.

Omolola Coker: Has the webinar been muted? Want to be sure that it's not my speakers that aren't working

USAID Microlinks: Hi Omolola, you should be able to hear our A/V Tech, Adam, speaking. Can you hear?

Omolola Coker: No I can't

USAID Microlinks: Everyone, if you were able to hear Adam speaking, could you let me know in the chat pod?

Audry Shematsi: no I can't

LuAnn Werner: Hi. This is LuAnn Werner. I can hear Adam and see the screen. Thanks.

Robert Dunne: Bob Dunne, Kaiser Ahmed and Ramen Sarkar for Action for Enterprise in Dhaka, Bangladesh here. Thanks for having us

USAID Microlinks: Thanks LuAnn and Robert!

USAID Microlinks: Welcome!

Christy Fellner: Sorry, I am also unable to hear Adam

Omolola Coker: I still can't hear anything, was able to for just a second.

Marcus Jenal: Hello. I can hear you clearly. My name is Marcus Jenal. I am with Mesopartner and work for the BEAM Exchange.

USAID Microlinks: Thanks Marcus!

USAID Microlinks: Omolola, our A/V Tech will private chat with you to help troubleshoot.

Omolola Coker: ok

Dick Tinsley: Dick Tinsley signing in from Colorado

LuAnn Werner: LuAnn Werner, Land O'Lakes, based in Minnesota, US

Audry Shematsi: still can't hear too

Sam Gotomo: This is Sam Gotomo of Making Enterprises in Liberia. I can hear you, but it seems you cannot hear me.

James Taylor: I'm James Taylor from World Vision's Economic Empowerment team.

USAID Microlinks: Welcome Dick, LuAnn, Sam, and James!

Dick Tinsley: sound check please

Candy Schibli: Candy Schibli, Microenterprise Results Reporting (USAID)

Jake Golden: Hi, yes I can hear you clearly. I'm Jake Golden with Global Communities in Silver Spring MD.

USAID Microlinks: Audry, our A/V Tech will private chat with you to help. Look for a blinking yellow box at the bottom of this chat pod.

Dan Goldman: This is Dan Goldman, an M.A. of International Policy & Development candidate

Dan Goldman: from the

Omolola Coker: Omolola Coker from the African Foundation for Development based in the UK and Sierra Leone.

Meredith Soule: HI this is Meredith Soule at USAID. I tested my audio and it worked, but I don't hear anything yet. Is anyone talking?

Omolola Coker: above. AFFORD

Dan Goldman: Middlebury Institute of International Studies at Monterey California

Meredith Soule: OK I hear now!

Dan Goldman: I can hear!

Christy Fellner: I can hear on the phone, but not through the computer

Candy Schibli: I can hear you

John Lipsey: Hello from Virginia Tech, can hear well.

USAID Microlinks: Great, thank you everyone!

Robert Dunne: AFE in Dhaka can hear you fine. We are at my house with 3 dogs barking so are on listen only

USAID Microlinks: Hi Christy--if you called in via your phone, you will hear the audio through there.

Thomas Tichar: Thomas Tichar, independent consultant on Market systems, gender and livelihoods

Emily Hogue: I could hear when I first joined, but nothing now

Emily Hogue: are you on mute now?

USAID Microlinks: Hi Emily--Yes, we are muted now. We'll test audio again in a few minutes.

Dun Grover: My audio is not working either

Emily Hogue: thanks

Dun Grover: thanks

Dick Tinsley: loud and clear

Tim Russell: Hi everyone, this is Tim Russell from MIT.

Omolola Coker: Can't hear you

Samantha Clark: Hi All, this is Samantha Clark from JSI/SPRING. Looking forward to the webinar!

Joan Whelan: Joining from RRB, from DCHA/FFP

Dick Tinsley: loud and clear'

Glenn Lines: Joining from upstate NY.

Emily Hogue: Hello, this is Emily Hogue from the Monitoring, Evaluation, and Learning team in USAID's Bureau for Food Security

Todd Flower: Joining from USAID Mozambique

Audry Shematsi: Hi, I am audry, from Democratic republic of Congo. ACDI/VOCA

Rita Diouf: Hello Rita Diouf Financial Officer for ACA (USADF Senegal Partner) can hear fine

USAID Microlinks: Welcome everyone!

Jerry Brown: Good morning. Jerry Brown here in Washington, DC

USAID Microlinks: Audry--so glad that you could join. Were you able to hear me speaking?

Omolola Coker: Can hear now but a bit static

Marthe van Andel: Sara and Marthe from Heifer NL joining in!

Marie Veyrier: Hi all, this is Marie Veyrier from Datu Research

Julie MacCartee: Julie MacCartee, USAID/BFS here. Looking forward to gleaning some lessons learned from these four projects!

Christy Fellner: Christy Fellner joining from World Vision US

Sara Karnas: Hi everyone, Sara here from BEAM Exchange

Chelsea Reinberg: Chelsea Reinberg joining for PCI Washington DC

USAID Microlinks: You should be able to hear Kristin O'Planick from USAID speaking right now.

Anna Garloch: Hi everyone, Anna Garloch with LEO

Julie MacCartee: I can hear Kristin well

Steve Hindle 2: Hi Everyone, Steve here, just finished at King's Sierra leone Partnership

USAID Microlinks: Wonderful, thank you Julie!

Malini Tolat: Hi, I'm Malini Tolat, Livelihoods Advisor for Asia with Save the Children US

USAID Microlinks: Welcome Malini!

Steve Morris: Hi There, Steve Morris of Yapasa Project in Zambia here

Jutile Loiseau: Hi everyone, I am Jutile Loiseau, Senior Nutrition Advisor, From Spring Ghana, West Africa

Steve Hindle 2: please mute the non-speaker microphones as we are getting feedback

USAID Microlinks: Welcome Steve and Jutile!

Junior Beauvais: Hi everyone, Junior Beauvais from Virginia Tech.

Katie Bowman: Hi all, I'm Katie Bowman, Senior Program Officer at Global Knowledge Initiative

USAID Microlinks: Hi Steve--all non speaker mics should be muted.

Kristin Babbie: Hello - Kristin Babbie with the William Davidson Institute at the Univ. of Michigan

USAID Microlinks: Welcome Junior, Kristin, and Katie!

Nicole Scotti: Hi! Nicole with FHI 360

Gunja Dallakoti: I can hear clearly

USAID Microlinks: Thanks for joining today, Nicole and Gunja!

Gunja Dallakoti: Hi This is Gunjan from Lusaka Zambia

Michelle Muldoon 2: Greetings. Michelle Muldoon, food/agric marketing consultant. In Washington, DC.

Daniel McMahon: Good morning! Dan from Fintrac Inc in Washington DC.

Tricia Peterson: Hi! Tricia with Samaritan's Purse in Bolivia.

Melissa Antal: Good morning, Melissa Antal from the Manoff Group

USAID Microlinks: Hi Michelle, Daniel, Tricia, and Melissa!

Michael Sayre: Good morning - This is Mike Sayre from Oceti Advisors in Washington DC.

USAID Microlinks: Mornin' Michael!

Amos odero: Morning, Amos Odero from the MasterCard Foundatoin

Amos odero: Foundation

USAID Microlinks: Thanks for joining Amos!

USAID Microlinks: Blog post Elizabeth referred to: <https://www.microlinks.org/blog/systemic-change-means-or-ends>

Margie Brand,
EcoVentures International: The upcoming LEO conference on Transforming Market Systems covers this type of topic in far more detail. Sept 27, Washington DC. Register at: <https://www.regonline.com/LEOconference>

sarah tisch: Hi sarah Tisch with Crown Agents USA.

Margie Brand,
EcoVentures International: It is a full day event. Just the opening plenary will be webcast. Register for the opening plenary webcast at: https://kdad.adobeconnect.com/transforming_market_systems/event/registration.html

Seni Diop: Good morning: Seni DIOP from EDC, MCF Project Senegal

Priscila Henriquez:
on Agriculture- IICA This is Priscila Henriquez from the Inter-American Institute for Cooperation

USAID Microlinks: Good morning Seni and Priscila!

Ben Fowler,
MarketShare Associates: Hi all, this was an early LEO paper on systemic change that

Elizabeth mentioned: <https://www.microlinks.org/library/evaluating-systems-and-systemic-change-inclusive-market-development>

Candy Schibli: thanks'

Sam Gotomo: Will the presentation be shred at the end?

Dick Tinsley: Does contract farming imply a surplus production over subsistence needs?

USAID Microlinks: Hi Sam--The PPT is actually available now through Microlinks: <https://www.microlinks.org/library/facilitating-systemic-change-insights-feed-future-programs-rwanda-senegal-ghana-and-zambia-e>

Sam Gotomo: That's great! Thanks

Dick Tinsley: Isn't in-kind payment the traditional norm and encourages early payments.
<http://smallholderagriculture.agsci.colostate.edu/cost-of-credit-informal-vs-institutional-credit/>

Raquel Gomes: In Senegal, Ben mentioned that govt decided to play a more active role in supporting the sector. What did the govt do differently and what drove that change? In other words, what motivated the govt to better promote the sector at this particular point?

Dick Tinsley: with combine or threshing contract the in-kind payment at a percent of recovery encourages higher quality of threshed grain

Dick Tinsley: how much of your cooperative market share represents loan repayment and how much is side-sold?

USAID Microlinks: Thank you for all of your questions so far! We'll be holding most of them until the Q&A part of the webinar which will begin around 10:00. But keep them coming!

Dick Tinsley: Is your fractional selling the basic financial management strategy for smallholders: <http://smallholderagriculture.agsci.colostate.edu/financial-management-strategy-retain-assets-in-kind/>

Jutile Loiseau: Dear Ben, was local organization evolve in this approach, what about influent leader in the community?? If yes how value was their contribution.

Alex Diouf: Gov negotiated with local importers to buy their rice from farmers groups

Alex Diouf: supported generation and dissemination of improved seeds

Jutile Loiseau: In Ghana, How strong was the MoFA participation in this program? What is your lesson learned for Ghana?

Dick Tinsley: you might want to consider the first value added is a clean bag of grain something that probably requires mechanical winnowing:
<http://smallholderagriculture.agsci.colostate.edu/1st-value-added-clean-bag-of-grain>

Alex Diouf: reduced VAT for local production

Dick Tinsley: Do the tractor contractor drift out of direct farming to concentrate being private service provider

Dick Tinsley: farming than becomes a conflict of interest with the service providing

Doris Owes: No, they don't, that means they run several business line. Own farm, tractor services, input credit, shelling services and aggregation.

Marthe van Andel: Which area of Ghana did this take place?

Doris Owes: that is why then need BDS support

Doris Owes: in the 3 regions of the North

USAID Microlinks: Thank you for your answers, Doris!

Dorothy Tuma: Dorothy Tuma joining from Kampala, Uganda

USAID Microlinks: Welcome Dorothy!

Gunja Dallakoti: Systemic change in general is a time taking process and often times it is difficult to report within the short span of development projects? How to handle this issue? How long did the project existed?

Marcus Jenal: Do you think the system would now be capable to self-organize into such a business arrangement without the USAID funded project?

Jutile Loiseau: In Ghana, What is your strategy to reach those 113 thousand farmers? I Think due to the lack of farmers organization ADVANCE should keep strengthening his relationship with other USAID funded project as SPRING and other, also work with local organization and MOFA in order to reach more smallholders farmers in the village.

Doris Owusu: definitely, cause we have improved access to market information and sign posting to other agencies

Doris Owusu: the 113 thousand farmers are identified around the OB at the community level.

Doris Owusu: because the OBS choose what smallholder farmers to work with

g alex: what were the main "good agricultural practices" that were the most profitable innovations for the area?

Doris Owusu: before ADVANCE?

Steve Morris: It seems the offtaker(s) with their warehouses are the scale agents in this model in Ghana

Doris Owusu: There are OBs that have warehouses in the community and can hold stock for SHF all year round too

USAID Microlinks: Give us one minute while we get Dan's audio working.

Steve Morris: But those community ware houses are linked to the big certified warehouses, no?

Doris Owusu: not necessarily

Steve Morris: so is there a difference in performance effect between the linked and the unlinked?

Dick Tinsley: regarding the systemic change in production you might want to review this article recently distributed by Aid & International Development Forum:

<http://webdoc.agsci.colostate.edu/smallholderagriculture/OperationalFeasibility.pdf>

AV Tech (Washington DC): Thank you to our presenters who are joining us from Massachusetts (Dan) and Colorado (Ben). As such, there are slight variations in audio levels ... thank you for your patience

Thomas Tichar: I can't hear anything, but that maybe a general technical issue?

Thomas Tichar: I will wait patiently for a change : -)

USAID Microlinks: Tomas, our A/V Tech will private chat with you. Look for the yellow blinking box at the bottom of this chat pod.

Anna Garloch: I hear fine.

Dick Tinsley: hearing ok

Steve Morris: I think it is your technical problem Thomas

AV Tech (Washington DC): Thomas, Dan's audio is slightly lower than the other presenters. You may want to check your system sound and raise it. I'll also private chat you.

Thomas Tichar: okay, thanks for letting me know! will do an audio check again

Christy Fellner: Thomas I called in and am able to hear while I watch the screen since I could not get audio to work on computer

Thomas Tichar: thanks AV tech and Christy

Anita Campion: What does CAD stand for?

Anita Campion: Community Agro-Dealer?

Elizabeth Dunn, Impact LLC: yes. Community agro-dealer

Anita Campion: thx

Dick Tinsley: aren't most of the CAD family enterprises

Jutile Loiseau: what is the life time of this project in Zambia??

Steve Morris: Sorry which came first? Producer Company which then established CADs or CADs forming a producer company?

Sam Gotomo: What is the Producer Company?

Steve Morris: I am assuming the producer company is an out grower operator

Steve Hindle 2: are the Producer Companies WHOLLY owned by the CADs or is there external capital supplied by an external agent that also has share membership?

Jutile Loiseau: This model is Amazing, Under the Map project this model was implementing in Southeast in Haiti by ACDIVOCA, and the impact was just wow.... hope you can keep it in Zambia....Good job

USAID Microlinks: Thanks for the feedback, Jutile!

g alex: did PROFIT+ put funding into the Produce Company start up? And in Ghana did the ADVANCE II provide start up funding for the service providers?

Jutile Loiseau: you are welcome

Dan White, ACDI/VOCA: @Steve Morris: CADs came first, then formed producer companies

Dan White, ACDI/VOCA: The producer companies are wholly owned by the CADs

Steve Morris: Thanks Dan, I'd love to explore this process more with you offline. We are developing CADs in our Yapasa project too.

Dan White, ACDI/VOCA: feel free to drop me a line at dwhite@acdivoca.org

Dan White, ACDI/VOCA: @anita campion yes CAD is Community-based Agro dealer

Dan White, ACDI/VOCA: @Jutile Loiseau the PROFIT+ project goes through end of next year (2017)

Jutile Loiseau: Thanks

Dorothy Tuma: How did the Rwandan population respond to the higher priced, higher quality milk? Was anything done to raise community awareness and encourage folks to purchase the higher priced milk?

Thomas Tichar: of these key findings, are these ones that you were initially looking to achieve with the project, or emerged during the project as unintended benefits?

Alex Diouf: @Dorothy, YES a large community awareness campaign was undertaken to support the initiative and stimulates consumption of safe milk that has n=been tested and certified

Dorothy Tuma: Thanks Alex Diouf. Who funded the awareness campaign?

Alex Diouf: project and Gvt funds

Maarten van den Dool: How is higher quality defined in comparison to standard quality?

Jutile Loiseau: Hope you already identify any strategy to switch the approach to the government in the last year then they can build a resilience beyond the project time life

Dorothy Tuma: Great example of collaboration across stakeholders!

Alex Diouf: @ Marteen, the acceptable level of contamination by the most important microorganism were defined and milk collection centers would test all the milk that arrive at the center and make sure the contamination level is acceptable and the milk safe to be consumed

Ben Fowler, MarketShare Associates: @ Maarten, the standards were benchmarked to COMESA standards.

Steve Morris: We were doing the opposite in Malawi where the formal sector was very well developed and reaching limits of growth (through lack of richer customers to buy any more in the supermarkets) and we concentrated on strengthening the informal sector and improving local vending where the real growth of the industry was. Interesting paradox

Dick Tinsley: have you looked at the processing milk by boiling in pressure tanks then injecting oxygen at 1500 psi, this will give you some 2 wks shelf life at ambient temperature. I ran into this in Irigina, Tanzania

USAID Microlinks: Thank you for sharing this, Steve! Which project were/are you working on?

Ben Fowler,
MarketShare Associates: @ Jutile that is critical. RDCP sees government enforcement as critical to the long-term functioning of the model.

Ben Fowler,
MarketShare Associates: The government is supportive, but whether enforcement will continue to occur long-term will only be apparent with time!

Ben Fowler,
MarketShare Associates: (Since it is only 6 months since the ministerial order was released).

Jutile Loiseau: for my understanding, in Ghana there is different USAID funded project supporting, and the Village are really in need, so the appropriate the approach fast. The Government is also supportive

Dick Tinsley: Aren't governments always voicing support but rarely have the financial resources to follow-up. I tend to encourage avoiding government involvement as much as possible

Steve Morris: The dairy work in Malawi was a small MMW4P project through VSO with Accenture funding

Steve Morris: Happy to chat about it at some point

USAID Microlinks: Thanks Steve!

Ben Fowler, MarketShare Associates: Sounds interesting Steve

Dick Tinsley: You might consider visiting the website: www.smallholderagriculture.com it review a lot of this but not necessarily in a "politically Correct" manner

USAID Microlinks: Thank you for sharing, Dick!

Marcus Jenal: That is the interesting question!

Anna Garloch: yes we can hear you

Thomas Tichar: yes we can Dan

USAID Microlinks: Go ahead Dan, we can hear you!

Dick Tinsley: if farmers become directly involved up the value chain, how will this impact on their basic agronomic practice for which they are over extended

Boubacar Diallo: I have a question regarding the sustainability of change. Is there assurance that change is going to last everywhere?

Dick Tinsley: sustainability depends on the degree of external facilitation and how well that can be phased out, which is rare

Alex Diouf: @Boubacar, so far the change is happening and because all actors have vested interest in seeing it working the system is likely to continue even without the support of the project

Alex Diouf: if it does not continue then it is not a systemic change

Boubacar Diallo: Thx Alex but

Thomas Tichar: that's a really good insight Elizabeth

Gunja Dallakoti: Thanks!!!

Thomas Tichar: yes, it's across the board

Boubacar Diallo: I agree that systemic change is a process but is there a study that specifically look at the systemic change 3-5 years after facilitation project

Ben Fowler,

MarketShare Associates: @ Boubacar, yes there is.

Boubacar Diallo: Ben, could you share?

Ben Fowler,
MarketShare Associates: We can provide links to some of the ex-post assessments that we've conducted under LEO.

Ben Fowler, MarketShare Associates: One was conducted in Cambodia and another in Zambia.

Thomas Tichar: okay, thanks so much for answering Olaf.... it's great to see that the M&E picked up on these positive spillovers and not just sticking to the narrow original goals

USAID Microlinks: Everyone--I will be pulling up polls in just a minute. Microlinks would greatly appreciate your thoughts!

Margie Brand: In case anyone missed the message earlier, the upcoming LEO conference on Transforming Market Systems covers many of these topics. Washington DC Sept 27. Register at: <https://www.regonline.com/LEOconference>

Margie Brand: Only the opening plenary will be screencast. Register for this if you can't attend in person at:
<https://kdad.adobeconnect.com/e4zrqs0uudz/event/login.html?login=margie%40eco-ventures.org>

Jutile Loiseau: Thank you Team for facilitating this webinar, it was high value for partners... please share it

Margie Brand: Apologies: Online registration at
https://kdad.adobeconnect.com/transforming_market_systems/event/registration.html

USAID Microlinks: Hi Jutile--a recording of this webinar will be available in about a week's time. Everyone will receive an email.

Thomas Tichar: thanks, need to drop off.... great presentation!

Marcus Jenal: Great last work, Elizabeth! Thanks very much for the interesting cases!

Elizabeth Dunn, Impact LLC: thanks, everyone, joining us

Margie Brand: Thank you!

USAID Microlinks: Thank you everyone for joining us!

Steve Hindle 2: Thank you!

Glenn Lines: Would like the links to ex-post studies.

USAID Microlinks: A recording of the webinar and other post event products will be sent out via email in about a week's time.

Sam Gotomo: Thanks!

Audry Shematsi: Merci