



MPEP SEMINAR SERIES

Exploring Frontiers in Inclusive Market Development

PRACTICAL TOOLS TO MONITOR MARKET SYSTEM DYNAMICS

WEBINAR CHAT TRANSCRIPT

AUGUST 4, 2016

PRESENTERS

Tim Sparkman, MarketShare Associates

Michael Field, Development Associates International

Eric Derks, The Canopy Lab

MODERATOR

Kristin O'Planick, USAID E3 Office of Trade and Regulatory Reform

Ferdinand Maneno: Hi everyone! Ferdinand Maneno, Adam Smith International (KUZA project), Kenya

USAID Microlinks: Hello Fernando!

USAID Microlinks: Thank you for letting us know where you are from and Welcome!!

Ferdinand Maneno: Thanks!

USAID Microlinks: Hello and welcome to everyone joining us today! Please take a moment to introduce yourselves on the chat and let us know where you are from!

Jackson Langat: Jackson Langat from Kenya

USAID Microlinks: Hello Jackson and thank you for joining us today!

USAID Microlinks: I am Carla from Microlinks

Jackson Langat: Thank you

Numery Abdulhamid: Hello everyone, Numery Abdulhamid, Mercy Corps, Ethiopia

USAID Microlinks: Good afternoon Numery and welcome to you! Thank you for taking the time to join us!

USAID Microlinks: We have shared some links and files to the left of the screen, please take a moment to check them out and read up on some background information

indra klein: Hi, indra klein, independent consultant, DC

Numery Abdulhamid: Thank you all the organizers.

USAID Microlinks: Hi Indra! and good morning to you!

Tasnuva Ahmed: Hello Everyone, Tasnuva Ahmed, I am a market development practitioner From Bangladesh, will be joining an upcoming USAID funded project in Bangladesh.

indra klein: looking forward to today's presentation!

Feed the Future:
KDAD Project: I could hear you!

USAID Microlinks: Thank you !!

USAID Microlinks: Hi Tasnuva! and Good evening to you!!

USAID Microlinks: Indra we are excited about the presentation as well!

Tasnuva Ahmed: Thank you. Eagerly looking forward to the presentation.

USAID Microlinks: Great - take a moment to take a look at some of the documents we have shared to the left of the screen or some of the links that the presenters have shared with you today

Dick Tinsley: Dick Tinsley from Colorado

USAID Microlinks: Hi Dick!

USAID Microlinks: Welcome to the chat pod! Please feel free to use this as much as you need to communicate with us for any questions you may have or audio/visual issues you might be having! we are here to help and participate!!

Dick Tinsley: sound check

Tim Russell: Hello! Tim Russell with MSM (FTF-VC Uganda)

indra klein: Yay! Loud and clear!

Andrea Harris: hi I can hear but there is some distortion on the line

Lauren Doll: agreed. loud and clear

Andrea Harris: I will try another browser

Jackson Langat: i can hear you and it is evening here in East Africa

Andrea Kuch: I can hear great, thanks!

Dick Tinsley: ok now loud and clear

USAID Microlinks: Hi Tim! Welcome fro Uganda!

USAID Microlinks: Thanks everyone!!

USAID Microlinks: @Andrea, google chrome can be tricky with adobe connect please try Mozilla or Internet explorer

Emilie Vonck: Hi All, Emilie Vonck from World Vision in Bamako

Andrea Harris: signed in again via explorer

USAID Microlinks: Hello Emilie and welcome!!

USAID Microlinks: great andrea i will do another sound test shortly

Isabelle Ouellet: Hello! I'm Isabelle Frome Development international Desjardin in Canada

USAID Microlinks: Hello Isabelle!! welcome and thank you for joinin us!

USAID Microlinks: Hello everyone! Thank you for joining us! Please take a moment to fill out the introduction polls so that we can get some feedback from the audience!!

Christopher Fay: Hello, Christopher from Peace Corps Colombia

USAID Microlinks: Hi Christopher! Welcome!

James Schmitt: Hi James Schmitt from Smithsonian

USAID Microlinks: James - welcome!

USAID Microlinks: thank you for joining us today!

USAID Microlinks: Please take a moment to fill out the polls for us before the presentation gets started!

Reid Hamel: Hi, Reid Hamel from CSIS's Global Food Security Project.

Christopher Fay: Sound is great!

Annick Vollmar: Hi all, Annick Vollmar from HELVETAS Swiss Intercooperation

USAID Microlinks: Hi Reid! welcome and thank you for joining us

Nadica Koskarovska: Hi Carla, Nadica Koskarovska calling from Don Limon, Germany

USAID Microlinks: Hello and good afternoon Annick!

USAID Microlinks: Nadica, Hi! Thank you for joining us!

Steven Miller: the phone number seems to direct me to enter my room number, and does not follow the prompts listed on the opening screen

Imee Cambronero: Hi, Imee Cambronero from Save the Children

Caroline Kasabiti: Hullo, the sound is fine here

Megan O'Donnell : hello is there sound yet?

USAID Microlinks: Hi Steven we are checking on that now

USAID Microlinks: Hi Imee!!

USAID Microlinks: Great - thank you Caroline! Great of you to be here!

USAID Microlinks: Megan - Hello! Can you hear us?

Chin Nobleza: Hi Im Chin from CRS Philippines

Marcus Laws: Hi, I'm Marcus Laws with NCBA CLUSA

Patty Hill: Patty Hill from IRG

Farah Chandani: This is Farah from MEDA Canada.

Portia Hunt: Portia Hunt from LINC LLC (Washington)

Thomas Tichar: Thomas Tichar, independent consulting

Scott Merrill: Hi, Scott Merrill from CARE

Deena Burjorjee: Deena Burjorjee, independent consultant

Elizabeth Dunn: Hi. This

Thomas Tichar: Oxford, UK based

Jennifer King: Good morning, Jennifer from MEDA Canada

USAID Microlinks: Hello Patty!!

Steven Miller: Steven Miller from Michigan State University

Jillian Baker: Hello! Jillian doing M&E at MEDA

USAID Microlinks: And Hi Farah!!

Raj Adhikari: Hi, Raj from Heifer International Nepal

Callie Ham: Callie Ham from the ILO in Geneva

Elizabeth Dunn: Hi! Elizabeth Dunn from the LEO Project

USAID Microlinks: Thank you all so much for joining us and letting us know where you are coming from!!

Anna Garloch: Anna Garloch with LEO, ACIDI/VOCA

Kari Foley: Hi Everyone, Kari Foley from Land O'Lakes International Development

USAID Microlinks: I am Carla from Microlinks we are going to get started very shortly

Jennifer Bremer: Hi, Jennifer Bremer from DC

Sara Karnas: Hi! Sara, from BEAM Exchange

Liliana Camacho: Hello everyone! Liliana from MEDA Canada

USAID Microlinks: Hi Sara! and Jennifer! Welcome!!

Ata Cisse: Hi Everyone, Ata from UNCDF in Senegal

katie prowse: Hi, Katie from DAI/Europe

Samir Panjwani: Hi, Samir Panjwani from Adam Smith International, Mombasa, Kenya

Carlos Alborta: Hi everyone, Carlos from Bolivia.

USAID Microlinks: Hello Samir from Kenya!

USAID Microlinks: Bienvenido Carlos!

Helen Lane: Hi, Helen from Self Help Africa, Ireland

Cheryl Turner: Hi Cheryl Turner from ACIDI/VOCA in WDC

Carrie Hubbell
Melgarejo: SPRING Washington DC

USAID Microlinks: Hi Cheryl and Carrie - good morning!

Chou Nuon: Hello. Chou from Episcopal Relief & Development in NYC

Autumn Gorman: Autumn Gorman, USAID Washington, Office of Private Capital and Microenterprise

AV Tech (KDAD, Washington DC): Kristin O'Planick is currently introducing the webinar. Welcome!

USAID Microlinks: Hi Autumn!

USAID Microlinks: Hi Chou!!

USAID Microlinks: welcome and thanks for joining us!!

Jarrold Goentzel: Hi, this is Jarrold Goentzel from MIT, part of the MSM team working with FTF-VC in Uganda.

USAID Microlinks: I am Carla feel free to let me know if you have any questions or technical issues!!

Cindy Lithimbi: Cindy from Mombasa with ASI on a youth jobs and skills programme (Kuza)

USAID Microlinks: Hello Cindy!!

Carana Corporation: Stephen Awuah, working financing Ghanaian agriculture project by Palladium in Ghana. Hi everyone.

USAID Microlinks: welcome to you!

Andrea Horak: Andrea from Accion (DC office)

USAID Microlinks: Hi Stephen! Thanks for joining!

Carana Corporation: thanks too

Michael Maxey: Michael Maxey - Part of the Feed the Future Global Evaluation Team.

USAID Microlinks: Hi Michael!!

Wanjiku Karanja: Wanjiku Karanja- FSD Kenya

USAID Microlinks: welcome and thanks you for joining us!!

Peter Hobby: Peter Hobby, KDAD DC office

Anne Swindale: Anne Swindale BFS/MEL Washington DC Hello everyone!

USAID Microlinks: Hi Peter!

USAID Microlinks: Hello Anne! welcome!

Monica Coutinho: Monica Coutinho, Technoserve Brazil

John Russell: John Russell, Eco Food Systems in Bend, Oregon

USAID Microlinks: Everyone please channel any questions that you have through the chat pod and feel free to answer or comment on questions here in the chat!! We strive for everyone to participate and discuss amongst each other. We will be channeling these through to our presenters as well!

USAID Microlinks: Bom dia Monica!

USAID Microlinks: Hello John!

USAID Microlinks: If you are having any audio/visual issues feel free to communicate with AV Tech - one of our hosts.

Andrea Harris: Can Michael please get a bit closer to the mike?

nina Schlossman: This is Nina Schlossman, Global Food & Nutrition/Tufts University signing in

AV Tech (KDAD, Washington DC): If you have any technical issues, please private chat me by hovering your mouse over my name in the hosts panel

USAID Microlinks: Hi Nina!!

Abdirizack Bare: This is Abdirizack Bare, Development Alternatives Inc. (DAI) Signing in

USAID Microlinks: @Andrea if you still have trouble let me know

USAID Microlinks: Hi Abdirizack!

xavier preciado 2: sentinel indicators? what did mr field say?

Jim Yazman: Jim Yazman, livestock sciences specialist with the USAID Food Security Services Center, supporting the USAID BFS Technical Unit

indra klein: How many locations were included in study/project?

USAID Microlinks: Xavier I have queued the question for you

USAID Microlinks: Hello Jim! welcome!

nina Schlossman: Hi - don't see any documents at left of screen.

USAID Microlinks: Hi Nina, we will pull those back up during the question and answer portion

indra klein: Businesses: Are they registered in their respective locales, adhering to regulatory/compliance requirements?

Dick Tinsley: Any particular reason why it is difficult to expand beyond what a family can supervise?

indra klein: With regard to obtaining data and analyzing as quickly as possible, how are you using mobile technology, such as apps to facilitate process?

USAID Microlinks: Thank you Indra and Dick for your questions and everyone else who has contributed!

Dick Tinsley: I think it has to do with people are so poor that the temptation to pilfer is too great and thus have to be supervise by an individual with financial interest, thus family member

AV Tech (KDAD, Washington DC): Our presenters are joining us from around the globe today and there are some different audio levels, please adjust your computer's sound output accordingly

AV Tech (KDAD, Washington DC): Thanks

Margie Brand: Kristin O'Planick (USAID; Hi - I'm Margie Brand from EcoVentures International :)

Kristin O'Planick (USAID; Washington, DC): Hi Xavier! Yes, sentinel indicator. Meaning an indicator that is easier to measure, but indicative of something bigger in the system. Like the proverbial canary in the coal mine.

Dick Tinsley: I think the family enterprise system handles the bulk of the business and support services for stallholder communities

Dick Tinsley: you might want to look at this case study of market channel (value chain) for tomatoes in Nepal <http://smallholderagriculture.agsci.colostate.edu/private-service-providers-family-oriented-fragmented-business-environment/>

Sara Seavey: There was a great presentation recently by PPL on Sentinel indicators

USAID Microlinks: Thanks for sharing, Dick and All!!

xavier preciado 2: thanks kristin, just couldn't hear clearly.

indra klein: When investigating commercial relationship churn, to what degree are you looking at ways in which business market themselves, especially when attempting to connect with larger businesses?

USAID Microlinks: Received Indra!

indra klein: Small business and mid-sized businesses at early stage of transition, is there any data of how mobile technology is being used to facilitate growth and development & better manage financial resources?

Sara Seavey: if others are interested in early warning/ sentinel indicators research: <http://www.fsnnetwork.org/project-level-early-warning>

Kristin O'Planick (USAID; Washington, DC): Thanks Sara!

Dick Tinsley: you might also look at the webpage on Financial Suppressed Economy as it impacts on limited purchasing capacity of an impoverished society and downward pressure on profit margins. <http://smallholderagriculture.agsci.colostate.edu/financially-suppressed-economy-2/>

Jillian Baker: These are great question to think about within a market system. Will we be getting to actual tools and methods, ie FGDs or mobile form data collection?

Anne Swindale: The third question in Tool 2 is qualitative and open-ended.. How are the answers to the question used to monitor this aspect?

Jennifer Bremer: Query: the speaker mentioned a resource paper, but I can't find it on the microlinks site. What's the link and apologies if someone already asked this and I missed it.

Jarrood Goentzel: Regarding financial flows, upon which information are traders giving these percentages? Do they have financial accounting systems or are using third party accountants for such financial information?

indra klein: With regard to underlying norms @ use of resources: Thoughts on how businesses are changing/have changed the manner in which financial resources are managed/allocated and inventory maintained when considering climate/weather variable?

USAID Microlinks: Thank you all for your questions! I am queuing them now for the presenters!

USAID Microlinks: And everyone feel free to comment where you can!!

indra klein: Has anyone addressed interest rates or other administrative fees that may impact behavior?

Anne Swindale: Tool 3 - what is it that you are wanting to see increase? Payment in advance?

USAID Microlinks: @ Jennifer - please note that additional resources will be displayed in the q&a portion

Dick Tinsley: how about overhead costs, and costs for advancing up the value chain

Michael Cooper: besides addressing different questions, what are the variations in the different "tools"?

indra klein: To what degree do small businesses influence market practices?

USAID Microlinks: Thanks all! Keep them coming!!

indra klein: Would you elaborate on "new market opps" and any role govt plays in such?

Jennifer Bremer: So far, they haven't really mentioned the degree of competition in the marketplace, often measured by how many actors account for 50% of market share, with a rule of thumb that you're in trouble if that number is not at least four. This can vary widely from place to place with more remote places having fewer buyers and therefore being more subject to bad trader practices.

indra klein: To what degree was cultural mores/influences considered in developing tools,?

indra klein: Does data reflect ratio of women-owned businesses vs men-owned?

Dick Tinsley: unfortunately the cost of remoteness is borne by the farmers, and the cost for off-tarmac transport can triple and that be almost transparent;
<http://webdoc.agsci.colostate.edu/smallholderagriculture/Off-TarmacTransportCosts.pdf>

Scott Merrill: Hi Jennifer, I think that the churn tool would capture some of the issues around competition

James Schmitt: These are small family owned businesses, how does external stress, such as livelihood concerns, drive transactions?

Andrea Harris: How did it work in practice to try to separate 'emotional' responses from other responses? This seems like it might be a difficult distinction to adhere to in practice during in-person interviews and other interactions...

indra klein: Does data reflect noticeable differences of approach/thinking between older and younger business owners?

Jennifer Bremer: Sorry, Scott, I think churn is useful but really measures something else. Lack of competition can be very stable, indeed, it seeks stability.

Scott Merrill: Exactly, so you wouldn't see much churn. I'm not saying that it would get you a lot of information about competition, but it could act as an indication to take a deeper dive into competition if you don't see a lot of churn.

Jennifer Bremer: Question: Did they find the market dynamics to be similar across different product classes (e.g., perishable vs non-perishable, volatile pricing vs less volatile) or pretty much the same?

Patty Hill: Looking forward to hearing how findings were communicated and used

Dick Tinsley: does the limited purchasing power of you consumer, restrict prices which eventually back up to limited selling price received by farmers, with the whole system operating on razor thin profit margins?

indra klein: Interim and final analysis of study: How will study results be used, especially with regard to promoting to entities interested in support of issues associated with programs?

xavier preciado 2: In case the presenters are not going to re-address this, if they could please re-cap again how these tools affected program decisions and were integrated into implementation.

xavier preciado 2: The comment on how often each tool was used was very useful, how often were the last two tools investigated

Jennifer Bremer: Regarding innovation, it would also be interesting to see whether they are entering nw markets, either geographically or in terms of products, but maybe that is included in one of the basic four.

Michaela Balan: it would be interesting to see if the authors got into understanding why companies changes their business models. is this covered somewhere? and what triggered the change

Elizabeth Dunn: During the development and testing period, did any information emerge in the form of a sentinel indicator that led to 1) further

indra klein: Did study include household/business income -- gross vs net and map them by sectors?

Elizabeth Dunn: 1) further investigation and 2) adaptation in program approach?

Margie Brand: Similar tools will be discussed at the upcoming USAID LEO Transforming Market Systems Conference in DC on Sept 27 at the RRB. Free to attend. Space is limited. Registration opens next week but as this is relevant to the audience here, I invite you to pre-register at: <https://www.regonline.com/LEOconference>.

USAID Microlinks: got it elizabeth

Michaela Balan: did the authors defined what they meant by a market system?

Jennifer Bremer: In my experience, a key driver of innovation in family firms is generational transition, as tradition-rooted daddy is replaced by educated and growth-oriented offspring (the latter gender-neutral, the former not so much). Did they look at this?

Patty Hill: Who uses these tools? How are they shared with market actors?

Michaela Balan: tim, really can you 'predict' that?

Jennifer Bremer: As a tool, I might look at the functioning of the major local marketplaces, e.g., how many operators, what services available there, how/how well is the marketplace governed? A growing system should be reflected in an improving marketplace?

Jennifer Bremer: For example, in Cambodia, there is a lot of retail trade taking place alongside wholesale trade; and traders not clearly differentiated between wholesale and retail trade; this is a sign of a poorly developed market.

AV Tech (KDAD, Washington DC): Feel free to download the relevant files from the "Shared Files" pod on the left of the screen

Dick Tinsley: The discussion as been almost exclusively on marketing, but wouldn't it also apply to input supplies, and other services like contract mechanization for land preparation etc,

Phil Steffen: Mike just mentioned using these tools in terminal markets. How applicable are these tools when looking into direct relationships or supplier-buyer contracts?

Jillian Baker: Interesting! Any possibility to merge the two: reporting and systems monitoring?

Dick Tinsley: please feel free to visit the www.smallholderagriculture.com website. It contains considerable information on market and related topics.

Anne Swindale: got it, thanks!

Raquel Gomes: Mike, though you're still analyzing the data, how have what you learned so far shaped your thinking on AVC project design?

AV Tech (KDAD, Washington DC): Thank you everyone! we will get to as many of the great questions you are asking as possible!!!

Dick Tinsley: how much of the accounting in the USA is associated with taxes that are easy to avoid in our host countries if the accounting is sketchy in the spiral notebook?

indra klein: \$ constraints with regard to technology, especially financial record keeping is an important factor and, in all likelihood, may be of interest to those philanthropists in support of such programs -- or at least create a funding pool that can leverage oon's ability to access such resources.

James Schmitt: Did any of the tools capture consolidation and the factors that drive it? I believe it would be critical in a family/social driven business environment

Jarrood Goentzel: Can you share more about what you have learned in developing the data collection tool? Say more about which kinds of questions were changed? What questions were most difficult for traders to understand?

indra klein: Financial resources: does this include insurance?

Dick Tinsley: have you factored in the overall financial management strategy that emphasis retaining good in kind as long as possible, marketing only small amounts to meet immediate financial needs. a practice that extend the marketing time up to 10 months after harvest: <http://smallholderagriculture.agsci.colostate.edu/financial-management-strategy-retain-assets-in-kind/>

Anne Swindale: But the questions do not specifically ask about delays

Anne Swindale: Just how many days in advance or after delivery

Dick Tinsley: On a somewhat different topic, how about packaging. I get concerned with the health of porter being paid by the number of 100 kg (220 lbs) bags. How often to these supper poor get a wrenched back requiring a week or more layoff. should a effort be made to look at more appropriate bag size?

indra klein: Would you elaborate on "new market opps" and any role government plays in such?

James Schmitt: Thanks! I'm curious in concern to efficiency gained from consolidation, such as marginal utility of labor or efficient capital use

indra klein: To what degree was cultural mores/influences considered in developing tools,?

indra klein: With regard to underlying norms @ use of resources: Thoughts on how businesses are changing/have changed the manner in which financial resources are managed/allocated and inventory maintained when considering climate/weather variable?

indra klein: How are tools being modified when used in remote rural area vs that of urban?

Jarrood Goentzel: Perhaps I missed it earlier, but how frequently do you intend to collect data for these sentinel points?

USAID Microlinks: I would like to invite everyone to participate in the polls that I just switched to! Your feedback is very important to us and to these webinars - please take a moment to give us your feedback! The Q&A will not end for another 10 minutes!!

Margie Brand: Again, similar tools will be discussed at the upcoming USAID LEO Transforming Market Systems Conference in DC on Sept 27 at the RRB. Free to attend. Space is limited. Registration opens next week but as this is relevant to the audience here, I invite you to pre-register at: <https://www.regonline.com/LEOconference>.

USAID Microlinks: Thank you so much for participating everyone!! We really do value your input - it shapes these webinars! Please take a second to fill out the polls! These are very helpful to us!!

Kristin O'Planick: related to this question, check out <https://www.microlinks.org/blog/when-sequencing-matters-why-we-changed-our-theory-change>

KDAD AV Tech: If you haven't filled out the polls, please do so, we're wrapping up!

USAID Microlinks: Thank you everyone for participating and for joining us!

USAID Microlinks: Please fill out the polls!!

indra klein: Thank you for interesting presentation, much to consider

USAID Microlinks: thank you Indra!!

USAID Microlinks: Your questions were great!

Sara Seavey: Thanks, eric, kristin, mike and tim!

indra klein: Thank you

USAID Microlinks: Thank you Sara!

Modibo Traoré: Thank you and see you for the next event

USAID Microlinks: Thank you Modibo!

James Schmitt: Thank you!

Jillian Baker: Thanks everyone!

USAID Microlinks: THANKS!

Marvalee Russell: Thank you joined late will review Marvalee Russell Jamaica

Jarrood Goentzel: Thanks for sharing your approach and experiences.

USAID Microlinks: Thank you for coming!!

nina Schlossman: thanks to all of you

USAID Microlinks: thanks Nina

Michaela Balan: thanks presenter, esp Mike!!!

Md. Rubait Reza Khan: Thanks!

USAID Microlinks: Thank you for joining!

Syed Wasel: Hi Mike, Tim and Eric, it was really great presentation. Thanks you all and the team.

USAID Microlinks: Thanks all. We're closing the webinar now but we look forward to seeing you again online soon!